

## **PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD**

**MONDAY, NOVEMBER 19, 2001**

**3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II**

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Bloomfield, Borys, Kreider, Raser, Senhauser, Spraul-Schmidt, Sullebarger and Wallace present. Absent: Dale.

### **MINUTES**

The minutes of the Monday, October 22, 2001 meeting were approved (motion by Raser second by Bloomfield).

### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, JACKSON & TWELFTH STREETS, OVER-THE-RHINE (SOUTH) HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Daniel Young summarized the staff report for an application to construct a fenced playground to serve the Oak Tree Montessori School housed in the Hale-Justis Building at 23 East Central Parkway. Mr. Young indicated chain-link fencing has already been erected without a building permit or COA; the portion facing Jackson Street is five feet high with privacy slats. The playground occupies a portion of a parking lot approved by the HCB at its December 4, 2000 meeting. Mr. Young indicated that portions of the landscaping, fencing and site improvements previously approved by the Board have not been installed.

Mr. Young said no one attended a pre-hearing meeting on this application; however, an adjoining property owner reported the neighborhood supports the playground which has brought activity and happy noise to the area. Mr. Young referenced a letter from the principal of the Oak Tree Montessori School justifying the fencing as installed. Staff recommended approval of the plan on the condition that the developer complete the site improvements previously promised.

Mr. Bloomfield made a motion (seconded by Mr. Raser) that the Board disapprove the fencing as built and direct the applicant to redesign the fence to be more appropriate to the district and better relate to the decorative, perimeter fence. In answer to Mr. Raser, Mr. Forwood said that an approval could be conditioned to run with the school's tenancy.

Ms. Pauline Childs, principal of the Oak Tree Montessori School was present to answer questions from the Board.

Ms. Sullebarger suggested that a uniform three-foot high fence without privacy slats would be more compatible. Ms. Child responded that the portion facing Jackson Street is higher to keep playground balls from the street and the privacy slats were to keep thrown and blown debris from the site. There was general agreement that the wrought iron fence on the rear of the site and the new perimeter fence were more

appropriate to the district, but that chain link fencing may be the appropriate to the playground use. Ms. Borys suggested that the school might be given a grace period in which to complete any required modifications.

MS. SPRAUL-SCHMIDT JOINED THE MEETING

Mr. Kreider said that a playground was preferable to parking and that its effect might be mitigated by additional landscaping. Mr. Senhauser suggested the portion of the fence facing Jackson Street be replaced with a new fence matching the decorative wrought iron fence at the rear of the lot.

**BOARD ACTION**

The Board unanimously (motion by Kreider second by Borys) to table the application in order to give the applicant time to consider the option of replacing the Jackson Street fence with a decorative wrought iron fence or to devise a landscape plan that would entirely shield the present chain link fence from view.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND CONDITIONAL USE, 1632  
HUGHES, OVER-THE-RHINE (NORTH) HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Caroline Kellam summarized the staff report for the rehabilitation of 1632 Hughes Street and showed photographs and drawings of the proposed project. She said exterior work included window and door replacement, masonry repair and the addition of a two-story porch on the south side of the building. In addition, the applicant has requested a conditional use for the residential use of the first floor.

Ms. Kellam explained that side porches are common in Over-the-Rhine multi-family residences, but that they were typically screened from the street, behind a wider front facade. There is no such screening in the footprint of 1632 Hughes, so as drawn, the new porch will extend to the sidewalk face. Staff recommended that the new side porch be shortened approximately ten feet to keep the porch from becoming a part of the front elevation. Staff also recommended approval of the first floor residential use as supporting the rehabilitation and occupancy of the building and historic conservation in the neighborhood.

Owner Chris Carmichael was present to answer questions from the HCB.

There was some question about the configuration and what kind of structure might have once been built along the south wall. Based on the black and white photographs presented to the Board, Ms. Sullebarger suggested that a side porch may have extended to the front façade, at least on the first floor. A ten-foot setback may not be necessary.

Mr. Senhauser questioned the relationship between the new porch roof and the rake of the existing building. Without a front elevation drawing, it was difficult to visualize the appearance of the addition as seen from the street. Mr. Carmichael responded that the porch would continue the rake of the existing roof, but acknowledged that the porch roof might have to be flat in order for the porch to be functional.

**BOARD ACTION**

The HCB voted unanimously (motion by Bloomfield second by Wallace and took the following actions:

1. Found that the rehabilitation of this building will remove a blighting influence from the community and will further the aims of historic preservation in the district.
2. Found that the adjacent uses and conditions would not be injurious to the health, safety or morals of the occupants of the proposed dwelling units.
3. Approved the establishment of apartments on the first floor of the building at 1632 Hughes Street in the Over-the-Rhine (North) Historic District as a Conditional Residential Use.
4. Approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of 1632 Hughes Street with the following conditions:
  - (a) The exterior stairs and porch be painted or have an opaque stain applied
  - (b) All exterior doors will be four-panel and those at grade level will be of solid wood
  - (c) Final plans, including a front elevation drawing and details of any porch setback, must be reviewed and approved by the Urban Conservator prior to issuance of a COA and building permit.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

Mr. Forwood reported that the Law and Public Safety Committee of City Council conducted a public hearing on Councilmember DeWine's proposal to modify the building code to address historic properties. Developers, architects and preservationists, including several Board members, spoke at that meeting. He said that there was general support for the proposal, but speakers identified areas of the ordinance that might be clarified. Mr. Senahuser said that the areas of primary concern included limiting and better defining the authority extended to the Fire Chief and the legal issue of equivalency under the ordinance. All had agreed that the effectiveness of the legislation would depend on the interpretation and efficient administration by the Department of Buildings and Inspections.

**ADJOURNMENT**

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned (motion by Spraul-Schmidt second by Borys).

---

William L. Forwood  
Urban Conservator

---

John C. Senhauser  
Chairman

---

Date